1	CITY OF NORTH CANTON, OHIO
2	BOARD OF CONTROL MEETING
3	
4	
5	TRANSCRIPT OF
6	APRIL 7, 2020, MEETING
7	VIA TELECONFERENCE
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	Transcript of Proceedings of the North Canton
14	Board of Control, taken by me, the undersigned, Laurie
15	Maryl Jonas, a Registered Merit Reporter and Notary Public
16	in and for the State of Ohio, at the North Canton City
17	Hall, 145 North Main Street, North Canton, Ohio, on
18	Tuesday, April 7, 2020, at 1:09 p.m.
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	Premier Court Reporting Canton 330.492.4221 Akron 330.928.1418
25	www.premierreporters.com

1	APPEARANCES:
2	Patrick A. DeOrio, Director of Administration
3	Timothy L. Fox, Director of Law
4	Stephen B. Wilder, Mayor
5	Jina Alaback, Director of Finance
6	(via teleconference)
7	Jahh- Ml
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	MR. DEORIO: All right. Welcome. It is
2	Tuesday, April 7, 2020. The time is 1 o'clock and
3	I'd like to call to order the North Canton board of
4	control meeting.
5	I will call the roll. Member Fox?
6	MR. FOX: Here.
7	MR. DEORIO: Member Wilder?
8	MAYOR WILDER: Here.
9	MR. DEORIO: Member DeOrio is here. And
10	Member Alaback?
11	MS. ALABACK: Here.
12	MR. DEORIO: It should be noted that Member
13	Alaback is joining us via teleconference connection
14	and we can see her from laptop on display in this
15	conference room.
16	So the first item
17	MS. ALABACK: I cannot okay.
18	MR. DEORIO: The first item on the agenda is
19	approval of the minutes. And the first packet is
20	November 13, 2018. Are there any additions or
21	corrections? If not, I would entertain a motion to
22	approve the minutes as presented.
23	MR. FOX: Motion to approve as presented.
24	MR. DEORIO: Moved by Member Fox, second by
25	Member DeOrio. We will do a voice vote. All those

1	in favor, signify by saying "aye."
2	("Aye" in unison.)
3	MR. DEORIO: All opposed? All abstentions?
4	MAYOR WILDER: Wilder.
5	MS. ALABACK: Abstain.
6	MR. DEORIO: Wilder and Alaback abstain.
7	Motion carries.
8	Next item is the review of the minutes from
9	February 25, 2020. Are there any additions or
10	corrections? Hearing none, the chair would entertain
11	a motion to approve the minutes as presented.
12	MR. FOX: Move to approve as presented.
13	MR. DEORIO: Moved.
14	MS. ALABACK: Second.
15	MR. DEORIO: Moved by Member Fox, seconded by
16	Member Alaback. All those in favor, signify by
17	saying "aye."
18	("Aye" in unison.)
19	MR. DEORIO: Opposed? The aye's have it.
20	I'm going to rearrange the agenda to allow
21	for the next item to be the Portage Street,
22	Northwest, resurfacing project. Given that this
23	subject matter will probably be less in duration than
24	the remaining item, I wanted to allow Robert Graham,
25	who is our city engineer, who is in attendance at

this meeting, to address this and then be able to report back for duty.

So if we will take a look at that on your

So if we will take a look at that on your agenda, Portage Street, Northwest, Resurfacing Project, Mr. Graham, could you enlighten us.

MR. GRAHAM: Yes, sir. Thank you, Mr. DeOrio.

We opened bids just last Friday, April 3rd, out on the portico. After 28 years, my first ever outdoor bid opening. We had five plan holders and three submitted bids.

A little history. This project is 80 percent funded with federal dollars, 20 percent on our own, and we have applied for municipal road funding through the county commissioners. Engineer's cost estimate prepared by our consultant was roughly 666,500. I had in the 2020 budget from last fall 637,000. And leading up to the bid opening we had the three bids submitted. In my mind, the lowest and best bid was submitted by Superior Paving & Materials, Inc., at a price of \$453,918.25.

Engineering would recommend that the board of control conditionally award this project in the amount of 453,918.25 to Superior Paving to complete it, and the lone condition is with our federal

1	funding. This project has an ODOT DBE, or
2	disadvantaged business enterprise, goal of 7 percent.
3	Superior submitted today their DBE affirmation
4	submittal to ODOT showing how they would meet that
5	goal. They would actually meet it with 12 percent,
6	but we're waiting for ODOT to just literally approve
7	that. I don't see that being a problem, but just in
8	case ODOT and the contractor can't come to an
9	agreement, we would have to go to our No. 2 bidder,
10	which would be 459,000 as you see on your bid tab,
11	but I feel comfortable they'll have that agreement
12	and agreement very shortly, so that was my
13	recommendation is the BOC go ahead and award to
14	Superior with that one condition that the DBE
15	affirmation is approved by ODOT.
16	MS. ALABACK: I would make that motion. The
17	board of control to approve or award the bid of
18	\$453,918.25 to Superior Paving on the Portage Street
19	resurfacing project.
20	MR. DEORIO: On the condition that an
21	acceptable DBE utilization plan is approved.
22	MS. ALABACK: Correct.
23	MR. FOX: I'll second that.
24	MR. DEORIO: It's been moved and seconded.
25	We'll do a roll call vote.

1	Member Alaback?
2	MS. ALABACK: Yes.
3	MR. DEORIO: Member Wilder?
4	MAYOR WILDER: Yes.
5	MR. DEORIO: Member Fox?
6	MR. FOX: Yes.
7	MR. DEORIO: Member DeOrio votes yes.
8	Thank you, Rob.
9	MAYOR WILDER: Thank you, Rob.
10	MR. GRAHAM: Thank you.
11	(Mr. Graham exiting room.)
12	MR. DEORIO: Okay. The remaining item on our
13	agenda is the property liability, general liability,
14	and automobile insurance package with the city. So I
15	think in your bid packet we put in a copy of the bid
16	tab from the opening which occurred on March 18 at
17	11:15 a.m.
18	Now, with insurance, it is often the case
19	that more than what is reflected on the bottom line
20	is important to evaluate, and what I'm referring to
21	are the coverage forms. You know, it's one thing for
22	an insurance company to tell you this is how much
23	your premium is, but what are you getting for that
24	premium? What insurance coverages are you getting?
25	And in the commercial insurance market, there are

differences in the different types of coverage forms.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And so this is a discussion that should have been had, in my opinion, five years ago when the city switched from its then carrier to the carrier that we have now, which is the Public Entity Pools of Ohio USI Insurance Group. Because five years ago we made a very different change as it relates to our insurance.

So what we had then was insurance on what is most commonly called an occurrence form. this form, any loss that occurs during the policy term is provided defense and indemnity regardless of when the loss becomes known to the insured as long as reporting requirements are met. So, for instance, we have an occurrence-based form, and just to make a conversation easy let's say it's during calendar year 2019. A claim occurs in June of 2019. And it is promptly reported. The carrier at that time would be on the hook for the administration and settlement of that claim no matter how long it took, even if it took years later. Because we followed the proper reporting requirement, we turned it in and it occurred during the policy period, even if it takes years to settle --

MAYOR WILDER: They're obligated.

MR. DEORIO: They're obligated to pay. Even
if we were to switch carriers and go with someone
else, that original carrier that had the policy in
2019 would still be on the hook to pay and administer
that claim. That's an occurrence-based form. That's

the most common and that's the best.

MR. FOX: I think that's what the -- like a layperson would think of in like their automobile insurance type of claim.

MR. DEORIO: That is exactly what you have with your auto insurance, your homeowners insurance that insure your home.

Now, let's say that with the occurrence form that Company A is on an occurrence form for 2019 and an accident occurs but the city isn't notified of that until January of 2020. If it's -- if we reported it immediately as soon as we heard it and determined that it occurred during the policy period, even though that policy period's over, even though that insurance company may or may not even be our carrier, they're still on the hook to administer and settle that claim. That's when it occurred. You can see why this is the best type of insurance that you can get. And generally with this type of insurance, you know, the premiums are going to be more than

something if you scale it back.

1

2

3

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

What would be the next type of coverage form that you would scale -- potentially scale back. claims-made form. The claims-made form provides protection for losses that have both occurred and have been reported or made during the policy term. So they occurred and were made -- the claim was made during the policy term. This form of insurance will provide defense and indemnity for losses that have been reported during the policy term, even if the settlement activities and judgment of such loss continue after expiration of the policy. Losses that have occurred during the policy term that have not been reported to the insurance prior to expiration will not be honored.

MR. FOX: So we had one that occurred. We had Main Street Festival, there was an elderly woman that slipped where some wires came across. And they had put down some things to prevent someone from tripping and a person simply caught their foot, because it was a little uneven, an elderly person fell. But under this, if that person did not report that claim or we didn't notice it and report that claim and they waited until later, perhaps someone encouraged them to file a claim and it's after this

1 reporting period, because they didn't tell us. 2 perhaps we wouldn't have noticed it, then that claim 3 would not be covered. 4 MR. DEORIO: That is correct. 5 MR. FOX: Okay. 6 MR. DEORIO: So claims-made policies normally 7 will offer a limited extension of time at expiration, 8 commonly referred to as tail coverage, to protect the 9 insured from losses that may have occurred but that 10 are unknown to the insured at expiration. 11 reported to the insurer. It should be noted that 12 tail coverage is limited in term normally to two 13 years after expiration. 14 Is that free? MR. FOX: 15 That is not free. MR. DEORIO: 16 So we have occurrence form, which is the 17 best, the most commonly used, and you can see why 18 it's the most commonly used. Then there is the 19 claims-made form, which reduces the exposure to the 20 insurance company and consequently may carry -- may 21 carry a lesser premium because there is an element of 22 risk to the insured, in this case the city, that if 23 something happens that we didn't know about it and we

So if I may, just so I have it

leave that policy, they may not cover that.

MR. FOX:

24

25

right in my head, you're going with this occurrence type of claims made -- beg your pardon. Claims made.

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. DEORIO: Okay. You're going with the claims-made form.

MR. FOX: Claims made, that if you don't have tail coverage, then you're assuming all of the liability for claims that could be reported but were not reported during the period of your policy.

MR. DEORIO: That's correct. So if you had a claims-made policy -- this is what makes it difficult. If you have a claims-made policy out there and at renewal you're looking at trying to go somewhere else, and you leave and you say I want to go to the occurrence form, the occurrence form is only going to pick up if it occurred during that policy period. So that's why you need the tail coverage, the extended reporting period, to give you coverage for up to two years while you're carrying forward with the new policy on the new coverage form. And although there would be a premium for that. That, as an example, two years ago, when we last did this out in March of '18, and I'll get to some of the -- more of the details from then, but we did obtain a tail quotation and that was \$78,000 for that.

MAYOR WILDER: Wow.

MR. DEORIO: Our premium at the time for all of our insurances were in the 110, 112, in that vicinity.

MAYOR WILDER: So for \$200,000.

MR. DEORIO: Yeah. Why the tail coverage is priced — one of the things I've learned from insurance is that if it's priced at practically nothing, it probably isn't really worth very much. But if they have priced it kind of high, then this is high, this is just for this instance of things that we don't know being reported, you're almost paying what we would have paid anyway.

All right. So there's occurrence, there's claims made, and there's a third. The third is what we have now. We have a claims-paid form. Under this form, only claims that both occur and are paid during the policy term are addressed by the carrier. I use the word "paid." Our previous form was made. So it had been — under the claims-made form, it had to occur and the claim made in the policy period. Even though settlement might occur afterwards, it would still be handled because it was reported and occurred under that premium.

Under this one, it says that the claim must

term. Losses that have occurred during the policy term but that have not been paid in full by expiration will not be further addressed by the carrier. This includes losses that may have been reported and defense initiated during the policy term. Defense initiated but not paid during the policy term that are not yet paid in full at expiration become the sole responsibility of the insured. In addition, any losses that have occurred during the policy term that the insured is unaware of at renewal that initiate against the insured at a later date are also the sole responsibility of the insured.

Now, what I have been doing, and as we go back and we look at some of these other things I'm going to bring forward, I'm not just relying on my experience with insurance and understanding what we're doing. We've had -- I've reached out to and asked for some analysis of what I just read to you that was provided to me from Jackson Dieken Associates in Cleveland, and Kelly McKeon is the manager there of their public entities program. He's got 33 years in the -- in the business and we've been asked -- explained the difference in a short -- as

concise as possible what's the differences between occurrence, claims made, claims paid.

Now, if we refer to our policy, for the exact language, effective -- I'm reading from Article 12, Member's Withdrawal, Cancellation, or Termination.

"Effective 12:01 a.m. on the date of withdrawal, payments for all claims and claim expenses shall thereafter become the sole responsibility of the withdrawing member without regard to whether a claim occurred or was reported prior to the withdrawal of the member's participation in the pool."

MR. FOX: So claims paid.

MR. DEORIO: Claims paid.

MR. FOX: And thinking of what if near that period of time there may be litigation. Having this claims-paid type of policy I think really ramps up for the city the need to perhaps settle a claim where it might be something that we would rather go to trial. But there's — certainly it's not a hundred percent, but even if it was — we felt very strongly that we would be successful at trial, we're gambling on not only winning, but if we lose we assume 100 percent if it goes over the date that this policy would lapse. It may compel us to settle a claim.

MR. DEORIO: It may cause us to take an

adverse action --

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. FOX: Yes.

MR. DEORIO: -- on a pending claim. And I think, you know, you can begin to understand with this process that if we're in this type of policy, help me understand and justify going through a competitive bidding process every year when, in fact, if we have such an open claim we -- we would be largely gambling on leaving. And two years ago when we addressed this issue, we did have a claim that was appealed from a lower court ruling that we had been victorious and at the time we were putting this out that was an open claim. So to get in a position where you're not gambling in taking undue risk in making a change from one carrier to another trying to leave a claims-paid form to go to an occurrence form, what we would need is another type of insurance coverage called prior acts.

So you heard about tail coverage. We explained what that was. That gives you an extended reporting period after the policy expires to report new claims. Prior acts coverage endorsement is a type of coverage form that goes back and overlays on top of your previous insurance policy back to a pre-agreed date. As if this coverage was in effect

1	at the time. It only covers those prior acts that
2	may be open or have not been settled at that time.
3	So the insurance companies, when they they price
4	this kind of coverage out, they ask for a loss run to
5	see what open claims you have, what type of open
6	claims they are, who might be the participants in an
7	open claim, and that makes a determination on whether
8	they'll even offer such a thing.
9	Yes, sir?
10	MAYOR WILDER: Do we have anything open at
11	this time?
12	MR. DEORIO: We do not have anything open at
13	this time.
14	MAYOR WILDER: Good. And are we looking
15	at
16	MR. DEORIO: That I'm aware.
17	MAYOR WILDER: Are we looking at a
18	termination date with our current carrier?
19	MR. DEORIO: Our current policy expires on
20	April 15 of this year.
21	MAYOR WILDER: Okay. All right. And from
22	your explanation, it sounds that the occurrence form
23	of coverage should be the direction that we should be
24	going.
25	MR. DEORIO: I have had the belief for a long

1 period of time that if we could get into an 2 occurrence coverage form it's the best policy for the 3 city, it offers the best type of coverage for a 4 situation where an organization as small as ours 5 where there could be changeover of personnel --6 That's where I was going to MAYOR WILDER: 7 go. 8 MR. DEORIO: -- would allow potential claims 9 to fall into a gap where they weren't reported and 10 therefore we would be on our own. With the 11 occurrence-based form it gives us a little bit more, 12 in my opinion, the protection that if the 13 administrator changes, the finance director changes 14 or just staff changes, a department head, and a claim 15 doesn't get reported up to scale that the occurrence 16 form would be our best -- best protection. 17 no protection about not -- against not being diligent 18 and careful about what you're doing about insurance, 19 but to the extent there might be some accidental 20 slippage it's less likely to occur under an 21 occurrence form. 22 MAYOR WILDER: The type of insurance that 23 ends now, there's no penalty for us that we're 24 leaving that carrier or anything like that?

MR. DEORIO: Well, there is.

I'll answer

25

1	that question now.
2	MAYOR WILDER: Okay.
3	MR. DEORIO: Because otherwise I might forget
4	to come back to it.
5	MAYOR WILDER: Okay.
6	MR. DEORIO: And I don't want to do that.
7	So under this particular type of pool that we
8	have right now, perhaps the simpler way to understand
9	it is there's a portion of our premium that is excess
10	premium.
11	MAYOR WILDER: Okay.
12	MR. DEORIO: That's put into a pot. And that
13	accumulates each year that we remain in the pool.
14	MAYOR WILDER: Okay.
15	MR. DEORIO: And each year that we remain in
16	the pool there's more of it, so that it could be used
17	for various things. What would be one various thing
18	it could be used for? One would be it could be used
19	for buying tail coverage
20	MAYOR WILDER: Okay.
21	MR. DEORIO: for leaving that plan would
22	be one.
23	MAYOR WILDER: Okay.
24	MR. DEORIO: But that's not what we're
25	what we would be seeking here if we were to

1 depending on what you guys decide on this 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 MAYOR WILDER: 10 11 12 like it was a two-year. 13 14 MAYOR WILDER: 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 MAYOR WILDER: Okav. 22 23 24

25

recommendation, but in all honesty, whatever that dollar amount has accumulated to at this time would most likely be forfeited. But I don't think that, in the grand scheme of things, when we weigh out all the pros and cons of these different coverage forms and whatnot, I don't think that it's a forfeiture that I think is, you know, a cost of doing business. Okay. Well, I felt we had to get it out there and I appreciate your forthcoming So the current policy we have now sounded MR. DEORIO: Two years, yeah. Two-year, and if we have the opportunity to go forward with your possible recommendation, what would the coverage period be for an occurrence form of -- of coverage? MR. DEORIO: Well, you know, you can get -you can have it, it's based on what our bid packet put together. You can quote it for one year --MR. DEORIO: -- two years, three years, whatever you think the marketplace is. I think last year, or the last time through, I had asked for a

two-year policy; the previous time it was a

1 three-year policy. 2 MAYOR WILDER: Okav. 3 MR. DEORIO: Just there's no set advantage or disadvantage. It's not like if we lock it up for 4 5 three years we can get a price discount or something 6 like that. 7 MAYOR WILDER: Well, we have insurance for a 8 reason. 9 MR. DEORIO: Yeah. 10 MAYOR WILDER: And I understand. 11 MS. ALABACK: Patrick? 12 MR. DEORIO: Yes. 13 MS. ALABACK: The bids that are on the bid 14 sheet, are those three same coverage type policies or 15 is the current one rebidding as a claims paid and the 16 other two are bidding at a different, either 17 occurrence based or claims made and are they one-year 18 or two-year bid-outs? 19 MR. DEORIO: Thank you. 20 The question is regarding the three bids that 21 we've received. The USI Insurance PEP bid is using 22 the form, coverage form that they have. That's all 23 that they're allowed to use. That is by their 24 membership in the pool. They're the only public

entity pool in Ohio, to my understanding, that use

25

this particular coverage form.

There's another public

There's another public entity pool in Ohio called The Ohio Plan, and I believe that the city of Louisville is under that plan. That is not a claims-paid form.

The Fidelity Group is representing a bid through The Travelers Insurance Company, and that is all on an occurrence-based form, and the Assured Partners is using US Specialty Insurance and they are using all occurrence-based forms as well.

MS. ALABACK: And they are one-year?

MR. DEORIO: Those are one-year policy

premiums. That is correct.

MS. ALABACK: Thank you.

MR. DEORIO: All right. So I want to read to you from two years ago, we had hired a consultant through the Huntington, Pat Corcoran, who guided us through our bid process and assembling the bid packet and putting that out and answering questions on applications that insurance companies might send in to try to figure out how much to quote and, you know, what are the risks. So I want to read to you what he had written last year.

"Leaving the public entities pool can be a very difficult and expensive thing to do if not done

1 properly. PEP's intergovernmental agreement provides 2 that if a member leaves, the member becomes 3 responsible for all open liability claims, as well as 4 any future claims that would be made against the 5 entity for the time period that the entity belonged 6 to the pool. Not knowing what kind of exit plans the 7 city might need" -- this is from 2018 -- "we provided 8 some options to consider. Prior acts coverage. 9 Ohio Plan" -- this is from Whitaker Myers Insurance 10 agents from two years ago. "The Ohio Plan has the 11 ability to treat the period that an entity belongs to 12 the PEP as though their policy is written on a 13 claims-made basis. The Ohio Plan can offer prior 14 acts coverage on a claims-made form to new members 15 leaving the PEP rather than purchasing the extended 16 reporting coverage from the PEP." And that was 17 estimated at -- last year at 78 -- two years ago at 18 78,000. 19 So two years ago our consultant came to the 20

So two years ago our consultant came to the same conclusion, that to leave the plan and extended reporting period, quote, is not the best course of action. The best course of action would be to obtain prior acts coverage. We had a quote for prior acts coverage at that time, and ultimately the sole reason we did not change two years ago was because the

21

22

23

24

25

additional premium that would have been required to make the move was not budgeted. And the finance director at the time believed that she was not in a position to be able to locate those amount of funds to be able to do so. And in all fairness, we should say that the ad — I was not — I had just become the administrator at the time, but while this was being assembled and put together I was the deputy director of administration and the finance director had only been here a couple months before me, so it was — everybody was kind of new on the job and trying to figure things out and it just didn't gel or come together.

The purpose of what I was trying to show was that this was an issue five years ago when we made the move. Three years later, a consultant comes in, makes the same recommendation that The Ohio Plan with prior acts coverage could make — could make it possible for you to leave. At that time — or now two years later The Ohio Plan chose not to bid on it, as many others through this process chose not to bid. Why? Because again, if you're unable to leave because there's an open claim, and you're unwilling to take that risk or unwilling to pay the additional amount to provide coverage to leave, why should I go

through all the effort to ask the city all these questions to underwrite this to come up with a premium when ultimately they're not going to leave.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So if our goal is that at some point down the road we would like to see more people bidding on this, more entities coming to bear, it would behoove us to have the type of coverage that would make it easy for us to make a switch should we do so.

So in addition to the coverage forms, there are other -- the other basic coverage limits as far as how much will we pay out if there's an automobile liability claim. How much will we pay out if there's a general liability claim. Those numbers are the same as our current coverage, which have been the same as the current coverage before. Our property coverage limits have increased over time. We've added buildings, increased the amounts. Our current policy as amended was provided to the other bidders at the time to base their quote off of that. So we don't really have to look at one has 5 million in liability, the other has 4 million. They have all got the same limits of liability so we're all talking about what should really be the important things: When will they pay; when will they not pay; under what circumstances? What risk is that to the city?

In an environment where personnel could possibly
change, what gives us the best opportunity to bid out
in the future, and I think that that would be with
the -- with an occurrence-based form policy and
obtaining prior acts coverage.

So the bids that were presented on March 18, as you have in your packet, one of those entities through Assured Partners provided a quotation for prior acts coverage. They actually gave two quotes for prior acts coverage, and the two quotes depended upon how far back you wanted to go with coverage. So the one that is put in your packet there is \$31,887. And that represents going back five years on the general liability; one year, I believe, on the auto, and five years — give me a second here. Five years general liability, five years law enforcement liability, one year auto liability. A shorter option was one year general liability, one year auto, five years law enforcement. So —

MAYOR WILDER: Are we talking pennies? You know, what's the difference?

MR. DEORIO: No. The one year GL, one year auto, five year law enforcement was 24,265. But five years on the general liability, one year auto, five year law enforcement, you're basically only picking

1 up four years' difference on the general liability is 2 31,887. So it's a difference of approximately 3 \$7,000. 4 MAYOR WILDER: Okay. \$7,000. 5 MR. DEORIO: But importantly, the five years 6 on both the general and the law enforcement would go 7 back to the time in which we had left our previous 8 occurrence-based form and went to the public entity 9 pool. 10 I like that. MAYOR WILDER: 11 MR. DEORIO: So it would go all the way back 12 to that beginning time. 13 MAYOR WILDER: Okay. 14 MR. DEORIO: Well, as far as the ratings on 15 the carriers, they -- US Specialty Insurance Company, 16 they're A++ superior rating with the financial size 17 category of 15. It far exceeds the requirement that 18 we have in the bid specs. And likewise The Fidelity 19 Group with using Travelers, the same situation. 20 Strength of carrier and A++ ratings are the kind of 21 things that we would look for if we were moving to a 22 different carrier. 23 In addition, the umbrella policy that is

being offered through US Specialty has a -- we'll

call it a provisional provision for coverage to apply

24

25

in a broader sense of the term. It's a good thing.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So I would just warrant a quick discussion on umbrella insurance policy. So typically the umbrella insurance policy acts like an umbrella over top of your underlying coverage limits. So your umbrella policy will stipulate a minimum amount that they need as underlying coverage. So if the umbrella is supposed to be, say, a \$5 million umbrella policy and the coverage underlying on the auto -- the coverage underlying on the auto is -- minimum required is 3 million, what you would expect that is your underlying automobile insurance carrier in limit would pay up to the 3 million and then the umbrella would fit down from the first penny above 3 million and give you 5 million of additional coverage on that. So the traditional umbrella, all your coverage limits are underneath there.

So if you have a -- let's say a high-speed pursuit with law enforcement that ends in a fatality and large property damage, you could have a claim that on the wrongful death exhausts the underlying limit of 3 million and starts tapping into the umbrella. But you also have property damage claim that could get exhausted and need to reach into that same umbrella. The umbrella just provides that

\$5 million over all those particular lines. You know, very bad situation typically involving, you know, law enforcement or EMS or fire, whether it's a wrongful death kind of thing you could find yourself in a situation where your underlying limits are exhausted and you're putting your umbrella limits at risk because all there is is 5 million. That's the typical coverage policy.

Under this umbrella, the umbrella acts as a separate limit over and above every single line of liability. So if we have our underlying limit of, you know, whatever the number is, 1 million, 2 million, 3 million auto then there's a 5 million umbrella above it. If, under the property damage, there is a million-dollar liability limit, now there is the umbrella above that. Each one acts as a silo above every coverage liability limit. So it actually gives us a lot of additional protection in the event of a really bad calamity.

I make that different as a point-out in the coverage difference form. So when we look at Travelers' price, which is being represented by The Fidelity Group, their bid was \$119,004, and if we look back two years ago, Travelers bid also, but they used different —

MAYOR WILDER: Formula.

MR. DEORIO: -- agency. Or brokerage. Their premium was 119,926. So you can see just trying to provide some idea that where we're at that, you know, I think pretty much everybody, you know, knows who The Travelers Insurance Company is and would recognize them as a household name and they're pretty consistent with their pricing, but with that, we don't have a prior acts coverage so then we would be back to an extended reporting period and having to get that coverage from the PEP, that premium would be a lot more and it wouldn't be as good as the prior acts coverage. The prior acts coverage would be a one-time charge for this policy. So we wouldn't have to be dealing with this in the future.

So it would be my recommendation that -- I should say before that, when we did the budget for 2020, we did build in some additional funding to cover getting some type of insurance to bridge this gap. And in reviewing that with the director of finance a couple weeks back, and again the director of finance is new to this city, certainly not to the position, but we were able to locate what we believe that we budgeted approximately \$25,000 in addition to be able to help with this, not knowing how much it

1 So it would be my recommendation that the would be. 2 city obtain occurrence form-based coverage policy; 3 that the city obtain a prior acts coverage; that 4 through the differences that we've learned in the 5 meaning of the -- of the coverage terms and some of 6 the other benefits of coverage through one of the 7 carriers that the city move towards and award this 8 contract for the insurance to the group represented 9 through Assured Partners at \$111,458 with an 10 additional coverage policy for prior acts of \$31,887, 11 making the total \$143,345 and that this would 12 represent the lowest and best insurance bid for the 13 city. 14 We will open it up to discussion, although 15 you all were participating as we went. So --16 MAYOR WILDER: Do you need a motion to accept 17 that and then go into discussion or are we okay? MR. DEORIO: Well, let me make sure that 18 19 everybody had a chance to weigh in. If there's 20 anything else -- to the law director first, if you 21 feel that anything else that we need to address. Ι 22 know it's a lot to process, so just kind of --23 MR. FOX: I'll start by, you know, thanking 24 you for the due diligence involved with this. 25 as any layperson in insurance, they have a belief of

how their policy operates and perhaps many occasions it's the trust from the person that sold them their policy. Because many people don't sit down and read a policy. And if they do, it's pretty complicated, perhaps, to understand and so they — I think most people rely on the representation of, you know, that person that wished to sell them the policy. Well, this is how it works, this is what's covered, and you simply rely on the verbal part. Okay, that's what I'll need, and then perhaps that's what they pay for. Here you dug into these difficult terms of art that in that business occurrence based and other types of terms to understand what that means.

There's -- I think always the thought that an accident or claim that's made while you're insured would remain for a reasonable period of time; that if you went to another insurance agency you wouldn't think your new insurance agent would cover, of course, they didn't represent you, but your former one with the, say, the claim that may not have been reported that a layperson would believe, well, I'm covered, I had insurance during that time. I had this policy, now I've switched, so I have to let the other one know, and to find out that you're not covered because there was a claim that wasn't

presented to you, you weren't aware of it. I think that that's -- that's significant in, you know, dispelling that belief, you know. People, I think the ones here, may go back and look at some of their -- their -- their own policies for their own insurance, but a significant factor for me is that the importance of this bridge policy and that only one of the three submitted a quote.

MR. DEORIO: And that's a great point. And we did not ask for it in the quote. And the reason that I didn't is that I didn't feel that it was up to the city to determine what the best course of action forward. We would evaluate what was being presented but leave it to the experts in the field to come up with a solution on how this could be resolved, and one, in fact, has done that very thing.

MR. FOX: Okay.

MR. DEORIO: Member Alaback.

MS. ALABACK: I appreciate the conversation.

I know we have been talking about this since January when I arrived. And I do remember and recall the budget adjustment that was made for the bridge insurance policy and understand that this is a good time, not having any known claims, to make this change to go back to an occurrence-based policy and I

1	agree that the five-year would be the best choice,
2	especially now knowing that that takes us back to our
3	last occurrence-based policy that covers anything
4	that would maybe come up in between. So if you need
5	a motion, I'm willing to make that motion to move
6	forward with your recommendation.
7	MR. DEORIO: There's a motion. Is there a
8	second?
9	MS. ALABACK: Okay. I'll second that then.
10	MR. DEORIO: All right. Before we vote, I'll
11	make one last ask. Member Wilder.
12	MAYOR WILDER: I just want to echo again what
13	Jina just spoke of. And again, I appreciate your
14	research on this and you have the funding that you've
15	researched for this. But most of all, I think it's a
16	new look at our risk management for our city for
17	property, liability, and automobile. And I would
18	concur with going forward, and if you need a second
19	to that motion, I would second that motion to go
20	with is it Assured Partners?
21	MR. DEORIO: Yes. With the insurance package
22	presented by Assured Partners.
23	MAYOR WILDER: By Assured Partners.
24	MR. DEORIO: So for the Record, it was moved
25	by Member Alaback, we'll say seconded by Member

1	Wilder, and we'll do a roll call vote. And we'll
2	start with Member Wilder.
3	MAYOR WILDER: Yes, I approve.
4	MR. DEORIO: Member Fox?
5	MR. FOX: Yes.
6	MR. DEORIO: Member Alaback?
7	MS. ALABACK: Yes.
8	MR. DEORIO: Member DeOrio votes yes.
9	Thank you all. There being nothing else on
10	the agenda for this meeting, I would entertain a
11	motion to adjourn.
12	MR. FOX: Motion.
13	MS. ALABACK: Seconded.
14	MR. DEORIO: Moved and seconded. All those
15	in favor, signify by saying "aye."
16	("Aye" in unison.)
17	MR. DEORIO: Opposed? We are adjourned.
18	
19	(Meeting adjourned at 2:02 p.m.)
20	
21	D// 1 0 5.1.2020
22	Allha 5.1.2020
23	
24	
25	

1	CERTIFICATE
2	
3	
4	STATE OF OHIO) STARE COLUMN.
5	STARK COUNTY)
6	I, Laurie Maryl Jonas, a Registered Merit Reporter
7	and Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, duly commissioned and qualified, do hereby certify that this meeting was by me reduced to Stenotype and afterwards
8	prepared and produced by means of Computer-Aided Transcription, and that the foregoing is a true and correct transcription.
_	-
10	I further certify that this meeting taken at the time and place in the foregoing caption specified.
11	I further certify that I am not a relative,
12	employee of or attorney for any party or counsel, or otherwise financially interested in the event of this
13	action.
14 15	I do further certify that I am not, nor is the court reporting firm with which I am affiliated, under a contract as defined in Civil Rule 28(D).
16	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand
17	and affixed my seal of office at Canton, Ohio, on this 14th day of April, 2020.
18	
19	Lauris Maryl Jonas
20	Laurie Maryl Jonas, RMR & Notary Public. My commission expires January 6, 2022.
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

{DEFENDANT} **MAYOR WILDER: [34]** 3/8 4/4 7/4 7/9 8/25 13/1 13/5 17/10 17/14 17/17 17/21 18/6 18/22 19/2 19/5 19/11 19/14 19/20 19/23 20/9 20/14 20/21 21/2 21/7 21/10 26/20 27/4 27/10 27/13 30/1 31/16 34/12 34/23 35/3 MR. DEORIO: [67] MR. FOX: [18] 3/6 3/23 4/12 6/23 7/6 9/7 10/16 11/5 11/14 11/25 12/5 15/12 15/14 16/2 31/23 33/17 35/5 35/12 MR. GRAHAM: [2] 5/6 7/10 MS. ALABACK: [15] 3/11 3/17 4/5 4/14 6/16 6/22 7/2 21/11 21/13 22/11 22/14 33/19 34/9 35/7 35/13 **\$111,458** [1] 31/9 \$119,004 [1] 29/23 **\$143,345 [1]** 31/11 **\$200,000** [1] 13/5 **\$25,000 [1]** 30/24 **\$31,887 [2]** 26/12 31/10 **\$453,918.25 [2]** 5/21 6/18 \$5 [2] 28/8 29/1 \$5 million [1] 29/1 **\$7,000 [2]** 27/3 27/4 **\$78,000 [1]** 12/24 **'18 [1]** 12/22 100 percent [1] 15/23 **110 [1]** 13/3 112 [1] 13/3 **119,926 [1]** 30/3 11:15 a.m [1] 7/17

12 [1] 15/4 12 percent [1] 6/5 **12:01 a.m [1]** 15/6 **13 [1]** 3/20 145 [1] 1/17 14th [1] 36/17 **15 [2]** 17/20 27/17 18 [2] 7/16 26/6 1:09 [1] 1/18

20 percent [1] 5/13 2018 [2] 3/20 23/7 **2019 [4]** 8/17 8/17 9/4

9/14 2020 [8] 1/6 1/18 3/2 4/9 5/17 9/16 30/18 36/17 **2022** [1] 36/20 **24,265** [1] 26/23 25 [1] 4/9 28 [2] 5/9 36/15 **2:02 [1]** 35/19

3 million [4] 28/11 28/13 28/14 28/22 31,887 [1] 27/2 33 [1] 14/24 330.492.4221 [1] 1/24 330.928.1418 [1] 1/24 3rd [1] 5/8

4 million [1] 25/21 **453,918.25 [1]** 5/24 **459,000 [1]** 6/10

637.000 [1] 5/18 **666,500 [1]** 5/17

7 percent [1] 6/2 **78 [1]** 23/17 **78,000 [1]** 23/18

80 percent [1] 5/12

a.m [2] 7/17 15/6 ability [1] 23/11 able [5] 5/1 24/4 24/5 30/23 30/25 about [7] 11/23 16/19 18/17 18/18 18/18 25/23 33/20 above [5] 28/14 29/10 29/14 29/16 29/17 abstain [2] 4/5 4/6 abstentions [1] 4/3 accept [1] 31/16 acceptable [1] 6/21 accident [2] 9/15 32/15 accidental [1] 18/19 accumulated [1] 20/3 accumulates [1] 19/13 across [1] 10/18 action [5] 16/1 23/22 23/22 33/12 36/13 activities [1] 10/11 acts [19] 16/18 16/22 17/1 23/8 23/14 23/23 23/23 24/18 26/5 26/9 26/10 28/4 29/9 29/16

30/9 30/13 30/13 31/3

31/10

actually [3] 6/5 26/9 29/17 ad [1] 24/6 added [1] 25/17 addition [4] 14/11 25/9 27/23 30/24 additional [6] 24/1 24/24 28/15 29/18 30/18 31/10 additions [2] 3/20 4/9 address [2] 5/1 31/21 addressed [3] 13/18 14/4 16/10 adjourn [1] 35/11 adjourned [2] 35/17 35/19 adjustment [1] 33/22 administer [2] 9/4 9/21 administration [3] 2/2 8/19 24/9 administrator [2] 18/13 24/7 advantage [1] 21/3 adverse [1] 16/1 affiliated [1] 36/14 affirmation [2] 6/3 6/15 anyway [1] 13/13 affixed [1] 36/16 after [5] 5/9 10/12 10/25 11/13 16/21 afterwards [2] 13/22 36/7 again [4] 24/22 30/21 34/12 34/13 against [3] 14/13 18/17 23/4 agency [2] 30/2 32/17 agenda [5] 3/18 4/20 5/4 7/13 35/10 agent [1] 32/18 agents [1] 23/10 ago [11] 8/3 8/6 12/21 16/9 22/16 23/10 23/17 23/19 23/25 24/15

agree [1] 34/1 agreed [1] 16/25 agreement [4] 6/9 6/11 6/12 23/1 ahead [1] 6/13 Aided [1] 36/8 Akron [1] 1/24 Alaback [9] 2/5 3/10 3/13 4/6 4/16 7/1 33/18 34/25 35/6 all [31] 2/10 3/25 4/3 4/3 4/16 12/6 13/2

29/24

13/14 15/7 17/21 20/2 20/5 21/22 22/8 22/10 22/15 23/3 24/5 25/1 25/1 25/21 25/22 27/11 28/16 29/1 29/7 31/15 34/10 34/15 35/9 35/14

18/8 allowed [1] 21/23 almost [1] 13/12 also [3] 14/14 28/23 29/24 although [2] 12/20 31/14 always [1] 32/14 am [3] 36/11 36/14 36/14 amended [1] 25/18 amount [5] 5/24 20/3 24/4 24/25 28/6 amounts [1] 25/17 analysis [1] 14/20 another [4] 16/15 16/17 22/2 32/17 answer [1] 18/25 answering [1] 22/19 any [9] 3/20 4/9 8/11 14/8 14/11 23/4 31/25 33/24 36/12 anything [6] 17/10 17/12 18/24 31/20 31/21 34/3 appealed [1] 16/11 **APPEARANCES [1]** applications [1] 22/20 applied [1] 5/14 apply [1] 27/25 appreciate [3] 20/10

approval [1] 3/19 approve [7] 3/22 3/23 4/11 4/12 6/6 6/17 35/3 approved [2] 6/15 6/21 approximately [2] 27/2 30/24

APRIL [6] 1/6 1/18 3/2

33/19 34/13

5/8 17/20 36/17 April 15 [1] 17/20 April 3rd [1] 5/8 April 7 [1] 3/2 are [32] 3/20 4/9 7/21 7/23 7/24 7/25 8/14 9/25 11/10 13/17 13/18

14/9 14/13 17/6 17/14 17/17 21/13 21/14 21/16 21/17 22/9 22/11 22/12 22/22 25/10 25/13 26/20 27/20 28/17 29/5 31/17 35/17

arrived [1] 33/21 art [1] 32/11 Article [1] 15/4 as [42]

ask [4] 17/4 25/1 33/10 34/11 asked [3] 14/20 14/25

20/24 assembled [1] 24/8 assembling [1] 22/18 Associates [1] 14/22 assume [1] 15/22 assuming [1] 12/6 **Assured [6]** 22/8 26/8 31/9 34/20 34/22 34/23 attendance [1] 4/25 attorney [1] 36/12 auto [9] 9/11 26/14 26/17 26/18 26/23 26/24 28/9 28/10 29/13 automobile [5] 7/14 9/8 25/11 28/12 34/17 award [4] 5/23 6/13 6/17 31/7 aware [2] 17/16 33/1 aye [6] 4/1 4/2 4/17 4/18 35/15 35/16 aye's [1] 4/19

back [17] 5/2 10/1 10/3 14/16 16/23 16/24 19/4 26/11 26/13 27/7 27/11 29/24 30/10 30/21 33/4 33/25 34/2 bad [2] 29/2 29/19 base [1] 25/19 based [13] 8/15 9/5 18/11 20/19 21/17 22/8 22/10 26/4 27/8 31/2 32/12 33/25 34/3 basic [1] 25/10 basically [1] 26/25 basis [1] 23/13 be [58] bear [1] 25/6 because [13] 8/6 8/21

10/21 11/1 11/21 13/23 19/3 23/25 24/22 24/23 29/7 32/3 32/25 become [3] 14/10 15/8 24/6

becomes [2] 8/13 23/2 been [17] 6/24 8/3 10/6 10/10 10/14 13/20 14/3 14/5 14/15 14/24 16/11 17/2 24/1 24/10 25/14 32/20 33/20

before [4] 24/10 25/15 30/17 34/10 beg [1] 12/2 begin [1] 16/4 beginning [1] 27/12 behoove [1] 25/6 being [8] 6/7 13/12

18/17 24/7 27/24 29/22 33/13 35/9 belief [3] 17/25 31/25

believe [4] 22/3 26/14 30/23 32/21 believed [1] 24/3

allow [3] 4/20 4/24